

1 **Queensborough Community College**

2 The City University of New York

3
4 **MINUTES**
5 **of the December 11, 2012**

6 **Academic Senate**

7
8 Interim President Diane Call called the fourth regularly scheduled meeting of the Academic
9 Senate to order at 3:15 p.m.

10
11 **I. Attendance:**

12
13 The complete Senate roster is available at
14 <http://www.qcc.cuny.edu/governance/academicSenate/roster.html>

15
16 As determined from the attendance taken by the i-clickers at the meeting, there were six
17 absentees.

18
19 Harris, Eugene Holden, Todd McKay, Devin
20 Pincus, Dion SG Programming VP SG President Pro Tempore

21
22
23 **II. Consideration of minutes of the November 13, 2012:**

- 24
25 • A **motion** was **made, seconded**, and unanimously **approved** to approve the Nov 13, 2012
26 minutes (*Attachment A of the Dec 11, 2012 Agenda*).

27
28 **III. Communications from:**

29
30 **Interim President Call:** Interim President Call referred to her written report (*Attachment B of the*
31 *Dec 11, 2012 Agenda*)

32

33 • President Call reported that our enrollment target for Fall 12 was 11,563 full-time equivalent
34 students (FTES). Due largely to a significant number of withdrawals, we attained only 11,385
35 FTES. We are therefore planning to compensate for this by increasing our Spring 13 enrollment
36 to 11,735 FTES.

37
38 • President Call reminded everyone that as of the first week in December, Spring 13 registration is
39 lagging that of Spring 12 at this time last year. We believe this lag to be attributable to super
40 storm Sandy and that we will be back on pace in a few weeks. Through the efforts of the
41 Enrollment Management group, an aggressive outreach effort is underway to remind continuing
42 students to seek advisement and to register as quickly as possible for the Spring 2013 term.

43

44 • President Call reminded everyone that many students along with faculty and staff have been
45 impacted by the storm. The QCC home page features an enormous amount of information and
46 links to resources and services for anyone impacted by the storm. This includes a QCC-specific
47 information page, featuring the make-up calendar, employer letter, and relief options available to
48 students, faculty and staff such as our Counseling Center, Single Stop, the U.S. Department of
49 Labor, CUNY's Work/Life program, and many local organizations. Financial assistance, including
50 how to donate and how students affected by the storm might apply for assistance has been noted
51 on our home page and communicated through multiple campus emails, Tiger Mail, text and voice
52 messaging, and social media channels. Over \$13,000 for student relief has been raised by our
53 college community, students, alumni and QCC Fund members. Students were notified of these
54 resources and requested/received funds distributed by the Dean of Student Affairs.

55

56 • President Call announced that Queensborough Community College's "**The Freshman Academy**
57 **Assessment Protocol**" has been selected as one of the 10 Bellwether Finalist Winners in the
58 Instructional Programs and Services category. Our college was competitively selected to
59 compete for the prestigious national 2013 Bellwether Award which will be announced at the
60 January **Community College Futures Assembly**. Congratulations to Dean Michele Cuomo and
61 her partners in Student Affairs and Academy Faculty Coordinators!

62

63 • President Call also brought our attention to the 21st Century Community Learning Center program
64 (21st CCLC) in the Continuing Education division, which has been selected by the federal
65 Department of Education as one of fifteen nationally to participate in a research study of 21st
66 CCLCs. The research project will study and learn from the field about four content-specific topic
67 areas of afterschool and summer programming, including (1) Science, Technology, Engineering,
68 and Math (STEM), (2) English Learners (EL), (3) Career and Technical Education (CTE), and (4)
69 structures to increase learning time (ILT). Under the direction of Dean Denise Ward, our 21st
70 CCLC program has been selected as an example of one which demonstrates strong promise in
71 strategies to increase learning time.

72

73 • President Call congratulated the Basic Educational Skills Department and the faculty who, on
74 December 7, presented on their use of high impact activities in instruction.

75

76 • **President Call congratulated Dr. Isabel Lizzul who chairs** The Academic Senate Committee
77 on Cultural and Archival Resources, and our Cultural Directors of the KHRCA, QPAC and the Art
78 Gallery, who invite all faculty to take a moment to view the cultural connections videos.

79

80 • President Call introduced The QCC periodic review team, co-chaired by Professor Glenn Burdi
81 and Dean Arthur Corradetti with Dr. Andrea Salis, Dr. Linda Reesman; and administrative support
82 from Elisabeth Lackner and Dr. Ian Beckford, has begun meeting and gathering documentation
83 and materials for the preparation of the report. The periodic review report is due to Middle States
84 on June 1, 2014.
85

86 • President Call advised everyone that the College Advisory Planning Committee (faculty
87 governance leaders, administrators and student leaders) will be meeting one last time this
88 semester for review of a comprehensive draft of the strategic plan for 2013-14. Beginning in
89 February, as is customary, focus groups will be held with the academic department chairpersons,
90 HEOs, and Student Government to review and discuss the draft. Following further revision
91 based on the suggestions and comments, as well as open hearings with the campus community,
92 the CAPC will meet in the spring semester to review and discuss the feedback and changes from
93 the focus groups and open hearings. The final version of our QCC Strategic Plan is due to the
94 University in late June.
95

96 • President Call ended her report with **Upcoming Events:**

- 97 • Currently on exhibit at our Kupferberg Holocaust Resource Center is ***Cruel Correspondence:***
98 ***Anti-Semitic Postcards 1895-1930.*** The exhibit, curated by Rabbi Isidoro Aizenberg, Scholar-
99 In-Residence, examines the content and usage of anti-Semitic postcards prior to the Holocaust
100 and how these graphic images became one more element in fanning anti-Jewish hatred and
101 discrimination, foreshadowing the impending destruction of European Jewry.
102 • The President's annual Holiday Luncheon for faculty and staff will take place on Thursday,
103 December 20, in the SUL. Two seatings are available to accommodate college employees at
104 either noon or 1:00.
105 • The Nursing Candle Lighting Ceremony for the graduating class of January 2013 will be held in
106 the Theatre on January 9, at 1:00 p.m.
107 • The annual College Convocation has been scheduled for Thursday, January 24, beginning at 9
108 a.m. in M-136. This year's convocation will feature the work of faculty with the use and learning
109 outcomes of high impact activities, including e-portfolio.
110
111

112 **Senate Steering Committee:** Chair Tai referred to her written report:

113 *(Attachment C of the Dec 11, 2012 Agenda)*

- 114 • Chair Tai reported that committee membership is stable at this time. However, given that we are
115 coming to the end of the fall semester, the Steering Committee and the Committee on
116 Committees would like to remind faculty who may be going on sabbatical leave to consider
117 resigning from any committee appointment they may be holding if they do not believe they will be
118 able to maintain active membership during their sabbatical. We likewise ask Department Chairs
119 to advise the chair of the Committee on Committees and/or the Steering Committee of any
120 resignations or non-reappointments of faculty currently serving on committees so that we may
121 appoint the proper replacements.

122 • Chair Tai reiterated that we will recognize anyone from the floor to speak and President Call said
123 she supports that. Over the past several weeks, the Steering Committee has been in receipt of a
124 number of queries from faculty members (some of whom serve in the Academic Senate, and
125 others of whom do not but attended the meeting, in accordance with Open Meetings Law), who
126 have been concerned about the lack of clarity that occurred in connection with President Call's
127 statement as recorded in the minutes of the November 13, 2012 meeting and the votes on
128 Curriculum that followed. (See attachment A of this agenda). For this reason, the Steering
129 Committee is recommending the consideration of the following resolution:

130 • Whereas, at the November 13, 2012 meeting of the Academic Senate members of the
131 Academic Senate appear as present on the roll but not recorded in the voting on matters
132 related to Pathways, which is not in accord with the obligations under the New York Open
133 Meetings Law (<http://www.dos.ny.gov/coog/openmeetlaw.html>; decision in Perez v.
134 CUNY 2006, available at [http://law.justia.com/cases/new-york/court-of-](http://law.justia.com/cases/new-york/court-of-appeals/2005/2005-08765.html)
135 [appeals/2005/2005-08765.html](http://law.justia.com/cases/new-york/court-of-appeals/2005/2005-08765.html))

136

137 • and

138

139 • Whereas, at the November 13, 2012 meeting of the Academic Senate several Senators
140 indicated that they did not understand what was being voted upon on as matters related
141 to (a) the rescinding of the October 9, 2012 Resolution of the Academic Senate to
142 “pause” in consideration of courses related to the Pathways Curriculum; and (b) the
143 “Resolution Regarding Transfer,” or “Pathways Curriculum,” in itself (as per Attachment
144 A, Minutes of the Academic Senate, November 13, 2012, lines 877-938)

145 •

146 • and

147 •

148 • Whereas, at the November 13, 2012 meeting of the Academic Senate the attempt to
149 have an exact record of the proceedings by electronic means, which might have
150 contributed to greater clarity on these points, met with technical failure so that there is no
151 recording;

152 •

153 • and

154 • Whereas, at the November 13, 2012 meeting of the Academic Senate, the attempt to
155 have an exact record of the proceedings by electronic means was related to an action
156 presented to the Senate concerning the statement of the President with regard to

- 157 satisfying the terms and conditions of the resolution adopted by the Senate on October 9,
158 2012,
- 159 • Therefore,
- 160 • **Be it resolved** that the Academic Senate rescinds the actions of the Senate on
161 Pathways related items, beginning with the action to accept the Statement of the
162 President as satisfying the terms and conditions of the resolution adopted by the Senate
163 on October 9, 2012, and closing with the vote that followed, as recorded in lines 877-938,
164 Attachment A, *Minutes of the Academic Senate*, November 13, 2012.
- 165 • Dr. Aránzazu Borrachero asked permission from the Steering Committee to speak.
- 166 • **A motion was made, seconded and approved with eight negative from Stuart Asser, Jonas**
167 **Falik, Jeanne Galvin, Melvin Gorelick, Anne Marie Menendez, Kip Montgomery, Regina**
168 **Rochford and John Luby** that anybody can speak on the floor.
- 169 • Dr. Aránzazu Borrachero addressed the students and asked them to make the vote for the
170 resolution to rescind due to lack of clarity and lack of information last month. She discussed why
171 the curricular reform is not good for these students. Professor Borrachero argued that students
172 would not be as competitively prepared if pathways passes because the curriculum will not be as
173 enriched as students are getting in other countries. She posed the question- Why should you get
174 less than more? Courses will not transfer outside of CUNY Is that a transfer solution? she asked.
175 Would any BOT member send their kids to a place where science courses are diminished in
176 content? NO, she argued. Administrators telling teachers what to teach is unacceptable. One
177 member of the BOT is approving a rich foreign language curriculum in private schools but not for
178 students here at QCC. She told a story of her colleague, Professor Linn, who is often asked by a
179 students why she is so demanding of them and her reply- because I respect all of you. Professor
180 Borrachero ended by asking students to respect the faculty who want the best for them.
- 181
- 182 • Senator McGill perceived confusion about the resolution. She asked if the resolution to rescind
183 were to pass, would this mean that Queensborough would not have anything for the Pathways
184 Curriculum?
- 185 • Professor Judith Barbanel stated that she attended a hearing on the grievance on pathways and
186 the Vice Chancellor Frederick Schaffer made his case for CUNY by stating that faculty have no
187 rights. All rights lie in the hands of the BOT. Professor Barbanel asked the senate, if they have
188 the right to pass courses on, why do they need our approval? She also stated that there are two
189 lawsuits filed by the PSC and the UFS which claim that pathways violates faculty governance.
190 Professor Barbanel said that last month faculty were confused and approved courses mainly to
191 support colleagues in English and Foreign Languages but 9 of those courses were returned for
192 revision. 7 colleges have passed moratoriums and numerous have stopped passing courses.

- 193 • Senator Pecorino addressed Senator's McGill question by saying that the November minutes
194 were approved where it stated that the President said pathways courses will and possibly have
195 been already sent. Senator Pecorino argued that it would be appropriate to ask those senators
196 who were confused to vote again. We can resubmit those concentrations or courses that are
197 independent of pathways to the senate. He stated that he supports the motion to rescind because
198 pathways "sucks".
- 199 • Senator Rogers said he wanted clarity regarding why the President oral statement was
200 inadequate and he wants to differentiate that from passing pathways courses.
- 201 • Chair Tai discussed two issues central to the writing of the resolution. The first issue was
202 confusion because the President introduced David Humphries as the new English chair and
203 issued her support. This led many senators to believe that her oral statement was related to only
204 support for the English department. The second reason was that an electronic failure occurred
205 and President Call's statement was not recorded.
- 206 • Senator Kolios said a no dialogue occurred and that there was no discussion adding to the
207 confusion.
- 208 • Senator Rogers asked if there will be follow up to her statement and Chair Tai answered that we
209 are prepared to rescind until a later time. Chair Tai also said we are dedicated educators and
210 divided votes will likely occur and divided votes should be respected.
- 211 • Professor Elise Denbo spoke about her support to rescind pathways. She told us that she is very
212 concerned about the pathways curriculum. Coming from a social worker and English teacher
213 background, she feels strongly that our students need more support, not less support. They need
214 the respect they deserve by slowing down, not speeding up. The mission of the college states we
215 respect our students.
- 216 • Professor Susan Jacobowitz spoke about her support to rescind pathways. She told us a story of
217 her father who was an immigrant, coming to America after his family was destroyed in the
218 Holocaust. He attended CUNY while working at night, with no money, and certainly not privileged.
219 CUNY changed his life and in return, he changed the lives of his family. CUNY should continue to
220 stand as that support for students who are not privileged. There is so much fear surrounding
221 pathways- but it's our collective name and she urged the senators to stand with the campuses
222 who took the no pathways stand.
- 223 • Senator Pecorino said his family was also not privileged, not college graduates but they taught
224 him work. He spent numerous hours reading and studying liberal arts. What is so sad is that 75%
225 of college students are NOT adequately prepared and the Pathways curriculum will further
226 compromise their readiness for the world of work. Dr. Pecorino referred to an essay he had
227 written about how Pathways was a "soft form" of bigotry, in that it represented a lower set of
228 academic standards, put forward under the assumption that students from immigrant and minority
229 backgrounds would not be able to perform at the same level as students from more affluent
230 backgrounds. These were his reasons for strongly opposing the Pathways Curriculum.

- 231 • Senator Kuszai said he contacted the steering committee after the November senate because he
232 was under the impression that the Presidents statement was recorded, but he later found out it
233 was not.
- 234 • Student Government President Baker said he was confused as to why everyone was confused.
235 Senator Pecorino explained that the senate voted on the common core courses but because so
236 many senators were confused as to what classes were pathways related, we should revote.
- 237 • Senator McGill said her understanding was that if faculty did not vote in favor of the courses we
238 were submitting then faculty were abrogating their control over curriculum. Chair Tai said the vote
239 is to rescind, not abrogate. Chair McGill contended that the issue is if we as educators will vote to
240 rescind a curriculum – the question is who moves them forward? The administration or faculty?
241 The classes are already forwarded but is this a statement that is made by the President or the
242 faculty? The point, Chair Tai reiterated, is that there should be no governance approval. As an
243 educator, Chair Tai wants it to be recorded that governance had a role in the curriculum being
244 passed or not.
- 245 • A **motion was made, seconded**, and unanimously **approved** to close discussion.
- 246 • Chair Tai read; **Be it resolved** that the Academic Senate rescinds the actions of the Senate on
247 Pathways related items, beginning with the action to accept the Statement of the President as
248 satisfying the terms and conditions of the resolution adopted by the Senate on October 9, 2012,
249 and closing with the vote that followed, as recorded in lines 877-938, (*Attachment C of the*
250 *November 13, 2012*).
- 251 • A **motion was made, seconded**, and **not approved with twenty nine negative votes from**
252 **President Call, Sherri Newcomb, Liza Larios, Karen Steele, Denise Ward, Rosemary Zins,**
253 **Antonella Ansani, Stuart Asser, Joseph Culkin, Mona Fabricant, Jonas Falik, Jeanne**
254 **Galvin, Melvin Gorelick, Ellen Hartigan, Anne Marie Menendez, Kip Montgomery, Georgia**
255 **McGill, Margaret Reilly, Lorena Ellis, Edmund Clingan, Regina Rochford, John Luby, Ann**
256 **Tullio, SG President, SG Executive VP, SG Treasurer, SG Evening Students, SG VP**
257 **Students, Diane Carey and five abstentions** from **Sasan Karimi, Belle Birchfield, Margot**
258 **Edlin, Kelly Ford, and Craig Weber**, to approve the motion to rescind.
- 259 • Senator Pecorino moved a motion to reconsider.
- 260 • Senator Pecorino pointed out that the minutes of the preceding meeting of the Academic Senate
261 of November 13, 2012 were unanimously approved with not one word of discussion or dissent.
262 Those minutes codify what occurred on November 13, 2012. In those minutes concerning the
263 courses nominated for the Pathways Common Core there was no approval for sending them on
264 to CUNY through the Pathways process.
- 265 • He noted that at lines 933-937 of the minutes the action on the Pathways courses at QCC is
266 described as:
267
268

269 "A motion was made, seconded, and approved with eleven negative votes from Emily Tai, Philip
270 Pecorino, Paul Weiss, Alexandra Tarasko, Lana Zinger, Aithne Bialo-Padin, Julian Stark, Bob Rogers,
271 Jennifer Maloy, Andrew Nguyen, and Cheryl Spencer, and two abstentions from Regina Rochford and
272 Anthony Kolios to allow these Pathways courses to be submitted to the Senate."
273

274 • He also pointed out that the QCC Academic Senate has not yet approved of any courses going
275 forward to the CUNY OAA and the Pathways Common Core. The only approval of the Academic
276 Senate was to lift the freeze and allow the courses to be moved from the Committee on
277 Curriculum to the Academic Senate.

278 • **A motion was made, seconded and approved with nine negative votes from Emily Tai,**
279 **Jannette Urciuoli, Richard Yuster, Paul Weiss, Isabella Lizzul, Georgina Colalilo, Joel**
280 **Kuszai, Anthony Kolios, Wilma Anthony-Fletcher and three abstentions from Edward**
281 **Volchok, Chiung Chang, and Andrew Nguyen** to adjourn the meeting.

282

283 **The meeting was adjourned at 4:30 PM**

284 **Respectfully Submitted,**

285 **Lana Zinger EdD, CHES, R.D. (Secretary)**

286 **Steering Committee of the Academic Senate**

287

288